

UDC 327.88:341.485](460:569.4)

Khmel A. O.

PhD in History, Assistant Professor,
International Relations and of Foreign Policy Department,
Petro Mohyla Black Sea National University,
68 Desantnykiv str., 10,
Mykolaiv, 54000, Ukraine
DOI <https://doi.org/10.32782/2707-5206.2024.37.18>

HYBRID THREATS BASED ON ANTISEMITISM AND ANTI-ISRAELI PROPAGANDA IN CURRENT SPANISH-ISRAELI RELATIONS

Israel and Spain have faced a range of security challenges in recent years, including terrorism, cyber-attacks, and disinformation campaigns. Though Spain-Israeli relations have been constantly developing, the researchers point out the contrary views towards Israel within Spanish society and politics. There are organizations as well as individuals within Spanish society that spread antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda, often based on a distorted and biased view of the Arab-Israeli conflict mixed with misconceptions, stereotypes, and misinformation about Israel and its policies. Moreover, they are not only threatening the Jewish people, but also undermining the values of tolerance, respect, and human dignity of non-Jewish population in Spain, which are either countering such crimes or supporting them directly or indirectly. Therefore, fighting the antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda by Spain with the support from Israel, can strengthen the human rights policies in these countries and contribute to the development of a more tolerant international society.

Methodology of this study combines the methods of comparative and descriptive analysis, that are used to investigate the dynamics of mutual relations between Israel and Spain in countering hybrid threats, focusing on antisemitism and anti-Israel propaganda within the context of international relations. The comparative method was used to compare different events in Spain-Israeli relations in order to identify the patterns and tendencies in mutual relations. The descriptive method was used to characterize these peculiarities.

Research objectives of this study are aimed at analyzing of the hybrid threats based on antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda in current Spanish-Israeli relations and suggest the ways of countering these threats and promoting a more constructive and mutually beneficial relationship. The study seeks to identify mutual mistakes in current Spanish-Israeli relations, and offer a complex understanding of the cooperative efforts necessity.

Specific features of this study: the human security problems in international relations are researched, focusing on the examination of the complexities of antisemitic and anti-Israel narratives, mistakes and misconceptions of Spain towards Israel. The study has the following **scientific novelty**: for the first time in Ukrainian science, the hybrid threats based on antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda in current Spanish-Israeli relations have been researched.

Main Results of the Study: the clear evidence of increasing antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda in Spain, the absence of forceful statements and actions from Spanish authorities towards terrorists and their supporters in EU and the Spanish government's opposition to recognizing the full and legitimate right of Israel to protect the population of the Holy Land from the Arab terrorist organizations, raises serious concerns and negatively affect the mutual relations between countries.

Key words: Spain, Israel, hybrid threats, antisemitism, anti-Israeli propaganda, international relations, human security.

Problem statement. Hybrid threats, antisemitism, and anti-Israeli propaganda are three separate phenomena, they are highly interconnected in the modern world and pose serious challenges to regional and international stability, human security and mutual cooperation.

Hybrid threats refer to the usage of various means of offensive: subversion, sabotage, diversionary tactics, and influence operations with fake news, defamatory campaigns, manipulations and disinformation in social media to one's own advantage. Antisemitism is based on the hatred and aggression toward Jews as a nation and anti-Israeli propaganda refers to false narratives designed to delegitimize Israel's existence or actions through selective presentation of facts, fabrication, distortion or omission of facts. All three have shared goals and are often used jointly to reinforce one another's objectives in order to maximize the negative effects on the safety of Jewish communities in the targeted countries, to turn the population of these countries against their Jewish communities and spread the activities aimed at international defamation and isolation of Israel.

Though the issues of antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda have deep historical roots in Spanish history, especially from the Inquisition era (when Jews were forced to convert to other religion, otherwise have been killed), nowadays there is the rise of Spanish radical left political parties together with the immigrants and locals, who support the Arab terrorist HAMAS, Hezbollah, Islamic jihad. These groups spread the antisemitic rhetoric, promote hatred against Israel and often employ conspiracy theories blaming Jewish communities for various societal problems such as economic instability and immigration issues. In this way they create hybrid threats for Spanish government and society. Ignoring these problems could lead to negative consequences. Therefore it is crucial for Spain's authorities to address these issues and take swift and effective steps to stop the growth of these problems.

Analysis of previous research and publications. Ukrainian academic scholars from international relations, political science, and sociology have explored different aspects of hybrid threats as well as issues of antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda. It is important to name some authors and few of these studies: Yu. Maneliuk, D. Pashchenko analyzed the key concepts of antisemitism as a political ideology (Maneliuk & Pashchenko, 2022), Yu. Radchenko studied the new perspectives in researching the history of the Holocaust in Ukraine (Radchenko, 2022), V. Palyvoda explored the ways to counter the hybrid threats in EU on the example of Slovakia (Palyvoda, 2020).

The foreign authors are largely contributing to researches of these topics. One of the recent research papers are M. Robin "European anti-propaganda policies" (Robin, 2023) as well as W. Bennett and S. Livingston "The disinformation order: Disruptive communication and the decline of democratic institutions" (Bennett & Livingston, 2018).

Despite the numerous publications on these issues, there are still no Ukrainian and no foreign academic papers that are analyzing the issues of antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda as the core components of hybrid threats in the context of Spain-Israeli relations.

Primary purpose is to research the hybrid threats based on antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda in current Spanish-Israeli relations and present the ways of countering these threats in for improving the mutual relations between the nations.

Presenting main material. The scientists point out the presence of opposite views within Spanish politics towards Israel, ranging from supportive to critical. It is important to review several recent events that highlight the controversial policies by Spanish government, politicians and political parties and how they can be used as hybrid threats.

Some political decisions can be viewed as one-sided and even biased, mainly because they were influenced by the rise of antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda in Spain. It is essential to consider that all the world countries are experiencing issues of antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda, and Spain is not an exception. The May 2023 survey by the Anti-Defamation League (ADL) suggests that one in four Europeans share antisemitic views with Spain having 26 percent of the population sharing these beliefs (Klein, 2023b). According to this report Spain has the highest of all Western European countries level of antisemitism (Klein, 2023b).

Furthermore the high level of antisemitic views in Spain increases the effectiveness of hybrid threats against the country because they provide a fertile ground for attackers, which target not only the security of Jewish individuals and Jewish communities but also universal values of tolerance, respect, and human dignity. For Spain it is increasingly important to counter antisemitism and anti-Israel propaganda, considering the tragic and painful history of Jewish people in this country, who were constantly facing diverse security threats and crimes: Spanish inquisition crimes against them, anti-Jewish laws, fostering the exile of the Jewish people from their own property and other human rights violations. In order to strengthen the Spanish society it is absolutely important to spread information about the 7 universal human laws according to traditional Judaism. In many Spanish big cities as well as in other big world cities, there are groups that learn these universal laws for non-Jews according to traditional Judaism (Artzi, 2021).

It is also necessary to mention that the current Spanish government constantly makes statements against the counter-terrorist actions of Israel on the territories of the settlements and Jerusalem. Therefore, it doesn't fully agree to support Israel's counter-terrorist operations; the Israel's sovereign authority over all its territories, especially the territories of settlements and condemn the Arab terrorist attacks, Arab illegal construction and so on (Government urges, 2023). In 2023 the Israeli parliamentarians abolished the disengagement law in northern Samaria and made statements about focusing their attention on the development of the Jewish communities on the territories of Israeli settlements as well as increasing the human security level on these territories (Knesset repeals, 2023). The actions by all the members of current Israeli government, especially Permanent Representative Gilad Erdan in UN, are aimed at spreading the knowledge among other nations about Israel, Jewish people, Judaism and its values as well as: "...the legitimate right of the Jewish people coming home to the land that God promised us" and "... Israel has been, is and always will be the homeland of the Jewish people...". (Erdan holds, 2023). It is highly recommended that Spain finally recognize the legitimate right of the Jewish people on the whole territory of Holy Land. In fact, Spanish government itself were struggling to keep the integrity of their country, they did not recognize the full autonomy of its administrative region - Catalonia and prohibited the separatist movement, suggesting that this movement is most far-right and xenophobic and finally arresting its members for terrorist offenses (Gorvett, 2023). It is highly suggested for Spain to fully support the integrity of the Land of Israel.

One-sided approach, in particularly to the Arab-Israeli conflict could be seen as biased and can only harm the beneficial cooperation between the countries. Moreover, as Isabel Diaz Ayuso, a Spanish politician has said during her visit to Israel in February 2023: “Coming to Israel or talking to Israelis is essential to understanding the reality of life in Israel. Otherwise, you will get a picture of violence that leads to brutality, and that is the only thing you will know about Israel” (Kahana, 2023). According to her, this is the result of fake news, that distort the understanding of Israel and Jewish people abroad. She is also very positive and supportive for the Israeli government’s judicial reform, because it indicates that: “Israel is a democratic country” (Kahana, 2023). Diaz Ayuso is constantly promoting the positive image of Israel in Spain, EU and on the international arena, fights against the boycott of Israel (Kahana, 2023).

Furthermore, some Spanish politicians as well as parties and organizations to which they belong, are openly supporting organizations, which are considered terrorist by the European Union and Israel. In February of 2023 some of the Spanish EU delegation members, particularly Ana Miranda (Greens/European Free Alliance group) and Manu Pineda (Spanish Communist Party), were not allowed to visit Israel on a diplomatic mission due to their support for terrorist organizations: Ana Miranda openly credits the anti-Israeli policy of Hamas (is terrorist according to the European Union and Israel legislation) and Manu Pineda praises policies of Hamas and PFLP (is terrorist based on Israel legislation). The Spanish government officially opposed such policy of Jerusalem. Israel authorities reported that the decision was based only on the Israeli legislative documents prohibiting the support for terrorist organizations. (Sherman, 2023). Later, on the 6th of June 2023 Pineda received award from the GCRP organization’s general coordinator, Sheikh Yusuf Abbas, the leader of anti-Israel movement against normalization between Israel and Arab states, who is involved closely with Hezbollah (designated as a terrorist organization by Israel) (Lempkowicz, 2023d).

The use of Spanish political parties and individual politicians by terrorist organizations could be seen as leverage to spread the antisemitic ideas in order to achieve the objectives of these terrorist organizations. Spain's position as the country with the highest level of antisemitism in Western Europe increases its attractiveness as a target for hybrid attacks from such terrorists. Israel's decisions are completely based on legitimate security concerns. All these terrorist organizations openly seek to harm Israel and Jewish people as well as destabilize the Middle East region as a whole. Hence, Israel aims to ensure its human security and counter hybrid threats that appear from the Gaza Strip, Judea and Samaria and other territories. Spanish government, as a partner in countering hybrid threats, needs to respect and understand Israel's security policy and recognize the significance of countering and preventing terrorist activities that pose a threat not only to Israel but also to regional and international stability.

Another example of the anti-Israeli policies is the actions of the Podemos' Spanish populist left-wing party. Being a member of the Spanish government coalition and a part of EU Parliament (with 5 seats out of 54) this party demonstrates a highly critical attitude towards Israel in EU Parliament, giving it 0% support out of the 71 analyzed EU Parliament members' votes on Israel, whereas the European Conservatives and Reformists Party (there members from Spain in this party) gives 96,18% of votes in favor of Israel (Lempkowicz, 2023a).

The Spanish left-wing parties frequently use antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda for their Spanish target audiences and for their supporters abroad. For example, in June 2023 Amparo Rubiales, leader of the PSOE in Sevilla, called Elias Bendodo, the leader of the Spanish Conservative party, a “Nazi Jew”. After Bendodo and Spanish Conservative party supporters demanded rectification from Rubiales, she did exactly the opposite: made anti-Israeli statements, repeated her insults and didn't offer an apology for her behavior. Finally, she was dismissed from her position (Lempkowicz, 2023c).

Previously, in February 2023 Barcelona Mayor Ada Colau terminated the twinning agreement with Tel Aviv and gave antisemitic and anti-Israeli statements, calling Israel “apartheid” (Hajdenberg, 2023). The European Jewish Congress and Israeli Foreign Ministry criticized the decision, viewing it as motivated by anti-Israel bias and lending support to extremists and terrorist organizations (Hajdenberg, 2023).

The radical wings of left parties are also targeting the Israeli officials and pro-Israeli activists. In February 2023 several dozen left radical pro-Arab activists, associated with Unidas Podemos attacked the Israel's Ambassador to Spain Rodica Radian-Gordon, who was invited to speak at Universidad Complutense of Madrid. The attack on the Ambassador could be also seen as a part of a trend in Spanish society towards radicalization of individuals, which further become engaged in hybrid threat activities. Spanish government was constantly advised to condemn such acts of violence, arrest the initiators of attacks and take measures to prevent similar incidents from occurring in the future (Lempkowicz, 2023b).

Social media, which are often used by offenders to spread the anti-Israeli propaganda and antisemitism have also currently faced criticism. Different anti-Israeli international organizations, agencies and groups affiliated with terrorists, that are shaping the EU narrative about Israel, are considered to pose hybrid threats in Spain-Israel relations. According to reports of Israel's Foreign Ministry on Twitter the number of antisemitic posts went up to 106% weekly increase in 2022 since Elon Musk became its director, as well as the total rise of the anti-Israel propaganda online (Muallem, 2023).

In May 2023 it became known that 7amleh - NGO, that boycotts Israel, makes anti-Israeli campaigns, praises the terrorists and attacks against Israelis is a “trusted partner” of Meta and a member of Twitter's “Trust and Safety Council.”, which gives them advises on Israel content moderation. Owners of the platforms according to Israel's Foreign Ministry constantly refuse to remove the anti-Israeli propaganda and antisemitic posts, hiding behind the “freedom of expression” statements. Opposite to “freedom of expression” the antisemitic and anti-Israeli narratives are used to manipulate public opinion and spread hate against Israel and Jewish people (Harkov, 2023).

The anti-Israeli propaganda and antisemitism as the components of hybrid threats are also used in UN by its members as a tool for issuing anti-Israeli resolutions, maintaining non-diplomatic behavior, and disrespect for legitimate claims of Israel. In the context of countering the hybrid threats Israel aims to combine its efforts at the UN with countries to struggle against the deception, lies and disinformation of Russia and its allies and those who support the anti-Israeli policies in the region (Wagenheim, 2023).

In May 2023 Miguel Moratinos, Spanish diplomat and politician, who is currently in charge of monitoring the issues of antisemitism at the UN, announced a meeting in Cordoba, Spain, in June to discuss an action and response plan for combatting antisemitism in UN and its member countries. Nevertheless, the meeting was

postponed to September as well as the official plans to adopt the universal International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA) working definition in UN, which was passed by 40 states and more than 1,100 organizations around the world. Anti-Israeli propaganda in UN serves as a catalyst for the spreading of antisemitic ideologies, increasing the potential hybrid threats towards UN countries (Cooper, 2023).

Despite the fact that the Cordoba meeting was postponed, in June 2023 the representative from Spain which is the member of Israel Allies Foundation took part in a policy summit in Prague on countering EU regulations on labeling products from the Golan Heights, Judea and Samaria, Jerusalem and boycott movements by EU. The aim of this summit was to reinforce and scale up the responses to these highly discriminational policies. Dr. Josh Reinstein, president of Israel Allies Foundation” explained that: “Labeling products exclusively from the one and only Jewish State violates the internationally-accepted IHRA definition of antisemitism” (Klein, 2023a).

Since the terrorist attack on Israel made by the terrorist of Hamas, Islamic jihad, Hezbollah on the 7th of October 2023, the level of antisemitism in Spain has risen dramatically, with thousands attending anti-Israeli rallies, with the widespread propaganda of violence against Israel in Spain, appearance of many antisemitism graffiti on the Jewish buildings, especially synagogues. Maxo Benalal, Secretary General of the Federation of Jewish Communities in Spain, urged the government of Spain and Spanish society that the situation is “truly terrifying” (Gillott, 2023).

Amidst the clear evidence of increasing antisemitism in Spain, the absence of forceful statements and actions against terrorist supporters in EU from Spanish authorities and the lack of the unwavering commitment of the Spanish government to full and legitimate right of Israel to protect the population of the Holy Land, attacked by “barbaric” terrorists, raises serious concerns.

In contrast to the EU leaders and officials, who arrived in Israel to express their full support to Israeli people, to learn more about the terrorist attacks of the Arab terrorist groups and to respond to threats in EU posed by terrorists with military, legal, law-enforcement and diplomatic counter-terrorism actions, Spain's Prime Minister Pedro Sanchez and government officials openly refused to visit Israel and failed to express the strong support to Israeli people. Pedro Sanchez and Spanish government officials chose to call for a “humanitarian ceasefire”. It is evident that such approach of the Spanish government fails to recognize the hatred towards the people of Israel and antisemitism as the root causes of this conflict and to address the urgent need for Israel to exercise its fundamental right to self-defense (Faggionato, 2023).

Moreover, many high officials within the ruling Spanish coalition made statements questioning Israel's legitimacy to defend itself against terrorists. One notable example is the social rights minister Ione Belarra, who openly questioned whether Israel had committed war crimes in response to Hamas' terrorist attacks, persistent rocket fire and abduction of Israeli civilians. She even went so far as to suggest that Spain should consider breaking off diplomatic relations with Israel if it was found guilty of committing such crimes. Her words have been met with strong condemnation across much of the Jewish community in Spain and abroad. Such statements of Spanish authorities are certainly fanning the flames of hostility towards Jews in Spain and abroad rather than seeking to legally prosecute violent Arab terrorists of Hamas, Hezbollah, Islamic jihad and their Spanish supporters as well as EU supporters (Spanish minister wants the world to isolate Israel, 2023).

Additionally, the current Spanish government encouraged the statements made by UN Secretary General António Guterres, in which he said: “It is important to also recognize the attacks by Hamas did not happen in a vacuum” (Staff, T. & AFP, 2023). Israel and its nations-supporters are deeply disappointed by Guterres' statement suggesting that there may have been justifiable reasons behind Hamas' actions. The undoubtful fact is that Hamas conducted an organized campaign of terrorist acts against the innocent Israeli civilians, launching thousands of rockets from Gaza and sending thousands of terrorists and their supporters across the border to carry out deadly attacks on both civilians and soldiers, Hamas terrorists abducted children and women (Staff, T. & AFP, 2023).

The Arab terrorist organizations such as Hamas openly use violent tactics of targeting schools, hospitals, and other civilian infrastructure, use human shields and child recruitment tactics, which further illustrates the cruelty and depravity of their methods. These actions are a clear violation of international law as well as human rights conventions and cannot be excused or rationalized under any circumstances. Therefore, there is no doubt that Hamas must be held accountable for their horrific terrorist attacks on Israel.

Many Jewish communities are currently raising serious questions about the future of their safety and security in EU countries, especially in Spain. Unless the Spanish government takes immediate and decisive action to disassociate itself from supporting the terrorist organizations such as Hamas, Hezbollah, Islamic jihad, legally prosecute them, as well as their EU supporters and clearly reaffirm its commitment to Israel's essential right to exist, the longstanding relationship between Spain and Israel will likely suffer irreparable harm.

Why is it important for Spain to work together with Israel in order to develop a mutual policy against the hybrid threats based on antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda and ways of countering these threats? It is the Jewish people, who have always been exposed to these issues both in the past and nowadays. Therefore, Israel can help Spain and other nations to counter these threats, respect each other and find mutual opportunities.

Lubavitcher Rebbe King Moshiach explains that Jewish uniqueness is caused by both the external factors like antisemitic violence, the treating of ashamed Jews by other nations as the separate people (which occasionally reinforced Jewish identity), and internal factors like personal decisions “to hold fast to the Torah, to the Jewish faith and tradition” (Inner Conviction). That according to the Rebbe has kept the people of Israel “alone” amongst the nations and preserved the uniqueness of Jewish people for two thousand years, despite “the lack of a country of their own, while enduring persecutions”. It is well-known that the most tragic of mass murder of Jews in the previous years was the Holocaust, which was also caused by propaganda of hatred and violence against the people of Israel (Inner Conviction).

In conclusion, the collaboration between Spain and Israel offers a comprehensive and effective approach to countering hybrid threats, especially those that are based on antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda. In order to counter these threats, it is suggested that Spain inevitably actively support the legitimate right of the Jewish people on all the Holy Land, as well as Israel's settlement, anti-terrorist security policies. In order to fully understand the Jewish people, their values, it is recommended that Spanish government should include the information about the

7 universal human laws according to traditional Judaism in the study curriculum as well as spread these laws on different levels of Spanish society. In this way Spanish society will become resilient to hybrid threats, based on the antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda. Additionally, by increasing the number of online and offline events with their partners from Israel: conferences, meetings, presentations or talks the Spanish government will increase their awareness about the reality of Israeli life and will counter fake news, anti-Israeli and antisemitism campaigns, manipulations and disinformation in social media.

It is highly recommended for Spanish lawmakers to pass laws that prohibit the activity of those Spanish political parties and individual politicians that are directly or indirectly involved in terrorist media activities, terrorist anti-Israeli and antisemitism campaigns, in particularly because they could be manipulated by terrorist organizations, which aim to generate the civil disobedience, turmoil and unrest within the Spanish society in order to complete their terrorist objectives.

Conclusions. Therefore, the antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda are very deep-rooted problems especially in Spain. They are used as key elements of anti-Israeli propaganda and antisemitism campaigns, social media manipulation and disinformation, political interference and manipulation of elections, terrorist media activities, for social unrest and civil disobedience effected by external actors (to create political turmoil), by political parties and individual politicians to exert ideas against Israel and Jewish people. The biased narratives, false information, and misrepresentations, as well as anti-Israeli propaganda distort the reality of the Arab-Israeli conflict and fuel hostility towards Jewish nation. Recognizing antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda as part of hybrid threats is crucial for effectively countering them, promoting mutual understanding, and developing actions that foster dialogue, education and awareness programs.

Such hybrid threats cannot be defeated unilaterally by Spain, only in cooperation with Israel and Jewish people, who are constantly struggling with these issues: different types of political, economic, and informational threats, which are aimed against them. Spanish government, as a partner in countering hybrid threats, needs to support the legitimate right of the Jewish people on all the territories of the Holy Land, especially settlements as well as Israel's security policy against terrorist activities that pose a threat to Israel, Spain and international society. Additionally, it is absolutely important for Spanish government to spread information about the 7 universal human laws according to traditional Judaism in order to strengthen Spanish society against the hybrid threats, based on the antisemitism and anti-Israeli propaganda. The passing of laws that prohibit the activity of Spanish political parties and individual politicians, which are a part of terrorist media activities, terrorist anti-Israeli and antisemitism campaigns, could also increase the security level against the hybrid threats in Spain.

References [Список використаної літератури]

- Artzi, D. (2021, March 15). Las 7 Leyes de Noaj. *Breslev Israel*. Retrieved from <https://es.breslev.com/485591/> [in English]. [Artzi D. Las 7 Leyes de Noaj. *Breslev Israel*, 2021, March 15. URL: <https://es.breslev.com/485591/> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Bennett, W.L., & Livingston, S. (2018). The disinformation order: Disruptive communication and the decline of democratic institutions, *European Journal of Communication*, 33 (2), 122–139. Retrieved from <http://surl.li/iotec> [in English]. [Bennett W. L., Livingston S. The disinformation order: Disruptive communication

- and the decline of democratic institutions. *European Journal of Communication*. 2018, 33 (2). P. 122–139. URL: <http://surl.li/iotec> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Cooper, A. (2023, June 18). UN Secretary-General Guterres: On UN International Day for Countering Hate Speech, Help Curb Antisemitic Hate Speech at the UN. *The Media Line Ltd*. Retrieved from <http://surl.li/iovqo> [in English]. [Cooper A. UN Secretary-General Guterres: On UN International Day for Countering Hate Speech, Help Curb Antisemitic Hate Speech at the UN. *The Media Line Ltd*. 2023, June 18. URL: <http://surl.li/iovqo> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Erdan holds mock Passover seder at UN attended by 70 ambassadors. (2023, March 30). *Jewish News Syndicate*. Retrieved from <https://shorturl.at/bhlzQ> [in English]. [Erdan holds mock Passover seder at UN attended by 70 ambassadors. *Jewish News Syndicate*. 2023, March 30. URL: <https://shorturl.at/bhlzQ> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Faggionato, G. (2023, November 25). Israel accuses Spain, Belgium leaders of backing 'terrorism' after Gaza remarks, *Politico*. Retrieved from: <http://surl.li/pfbbr> [in English]. [Faggionato G. Israel accuses Spain, Belgium leaders of backing 'terrorism' after Gaza remarks, *Politico*. 2023, November 25. URL: <http://surl.li/pfbbr> (дата звернення: 30.11.2023)].
- Gillott, H. (2023, October 19). 'Truly terrifying' rise in Jew hate in Spain as thousands attend pro-Palestinian rallies *The Jewish Chronicle*. Retrieved from <http://surl.li/pfbcg> [in English]. [Gillott H. 'Truly terrifying' rise in Jew hate in Spain as thousands attend pro-Palestinian rallies *The Jewish Chronicle*. 2023, October 19. URL: <http://surl.li/pfbcg> (дата звернення: 30.10.2023)].
- Gorvett, J. (2023, May 20) Catalonia Can't Quit Madrid. *Foreign Policy (FP)*. Retrieved from <https://shorturl.at/kxzFW> [in English]. [Gorvett J. Catalonia Can't Quit Madrid. *Foreign Policy (FP)*. 2023, May 20. URL: <https://shorturl.at/kxzFW> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Government urges Israel to respect humanitarian law following violence escalation in Gaza (2023, May 10). *The Diplomat in Spain*. Retrieved from <https://shorturl.at/cosGZ> [in English]. [Government urges Israel to respect humanitarian law following violence escalation in Gaza. *The Diplomat in Spain*. 2023, May 10. URL: <https://shorturl.at/cosGZ> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Hajdenberg, J. (2023, February 9). Barcelona mayor severs ties with twin city of Tel Aviv, citing Israeli 'apartheid'. *Jewish News*. Retrieved from <https://shorturl.at/oHTY9> [in English]. [Hajdenberg J. Barcelona mayor severs ties with twin city of Tel Aviv, citing Israeli 'apartheid'. *Jewish News*. 2023, February 9. URL: <https://shorturl.at/oHTY9> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Harkov, L. (2023, May 24). Terror-supporting NGO advises Facebook on Israel content moderation. *Jerusalem Post*. Retrieved from <http://surl.li/iouuw> [in English]. [Harkov L. Terror-supporting NGO advises Facebook on Israel content moderation. *Jerusalem Post*. 2023, May 24. URL: <http://surl.li/iouuw> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Inner Conviction. (n.d.). <https://www.torahinten.org>. Retrieved from <https://www.torahinten.org/blog/inner-conviction> [in English]. [Inner Conviction. (n.d.). URL: <https://www.torahinten.org/blog/inner-conviction> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Kahana, A. (2023, February 16). "We cannot put a question mark on Israel". *Israel Hayom, Jewish News Syndicate*. Retrieved from <https://shorturl.at/cuwz3> [in English]. [Kahana A. "We cannot put a question mark on Israel". *Israel Hayom, Jewish News Syndicate*. 2023, February 16. URL: <https://shorturl.at/cuwz3> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Klein, Z. (2023a, June 10). Israel's allies meet in Europe to combat labeling regulations. *Jerusalem Post*. Retrieved from <http://surl.li/iovsi> [in English]. [Klein Z. Israel's allies meet in Europe to combat labeling regulations. *Jerusalem Post*. 2023a, June 10. URL: <http://surl.li/iovsi> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Klein, Z. (2023b, May 31). One in four Europeans harbor antisemitic attitudes, new ADL survey shows. *Jerusalem Post*. Retrieved from <https://shorturl.at/qrMT2> [in English]. [Klein Z. One in four Europeans harbor antisemitic attitudes, new ADL survey shows. *Jerusalem Post*. 2023b, May 31. URL: <https://shorturl.at/qrMT2> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Knesset repeals disengagement law for northern Samaria. (2023, March 21). *Jewish News Syndicate*. Retrieved from <https://shorturl.at/xHIR8> [in English]. [Knesset repeals disengagement law for northern Samaria. *Jewish News Syndicate*. 2023, March 21. URL: <https://shorturl.at/xHIR8> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Lempkowicz, Y. (2023a, April 26). First-ever ranking of EU Parliament members vote on Israel presented in Brussels. *European Jewish Press*. Retrieved from <https://shorturl.at/bopKS> [in English]. [Lempkowicz Y. First-ever ranking of EU Parliament members vote on Israel presented in Brussels. *European Jewish Press*. 2023a, April 26. URL: <https://shorturl.at/bopKS> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Lempkowicz, Y. (2023b, February 12). Israel's ambassador to Spain attacked by pro-Palestinian activists during conference in Madrid University. *European Jewish Press*. Retrieved from <http://surl.li/ioupq> [in English]. [Lempkowicz Y. Israel's ambassador to Spain attacked by pro-Palestinian activists during conference in Madrid University. *European Jewish Press*. 2023b, February 12. URL: <http://surl.li/ioupq> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Lempkowicz, Y. (2023c, June 13). Spanish Socialist politician resigns after calling her rival 'Nazi Jew'. *European Jewish Press*. Retrieved from: <https://shorturl.at/bpzEH> [in English]. [Lempkowicz Y. Spanish

- Socialist politician resigns after calling her rival ‘Nazi Jew’. *European Jewish Press*. 2023c, June 13. URL: <https://shorturl.at/bpzEH> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Lempkiewicz, Y. (2023d, June 6). Spanish Member of the European Parliament receives an award from Hezbollah-affiliated organization in Beirut. *European Jewish Press*. Retrieved from <https://shorturl.at/xEH37> [in English]. [Lempkiewicz Y. Spanish Member of the European Parliament receives an award from Hezbollah-affiliated organization in Beirut. *European Jewish Press*. 2023d, June 6. URL: <https://shorturl.at/xEH37> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Maneliuk, Yu., & Pashchenko, D. (2022). Antisemitism as a political ideology: origins and modernity. *Actual problems of politics, issue 69*, 27–34 [in Ukrainian]. [Манельюк Ю. М., Пащенко Д. Г. Антисемітизм як політична ідеологія: витоки і сучасність. *Актуальні проблеми політики*. 2022. Вип. 69. С. 27–34. <https://doi.org/10.32837/app.v0i69.1298> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Mualem, M. (2023, May 21). Antisemitism skyrockets on Twitter, as Israel's requests go ignored. *Al-Monitor*. Retrieved from <http://surl.li/iouss> [in English]. [Mualem M. Antisemitism skyrockets on Twitter, as Israel's requests go ignored. *Al-Monitor*. 2023, May 21. URL: <http://surl.li/iouss> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Palyvoda, V. (2020). Slovakia's approaches to combating hybrid threats: analyst from NISS expert. National Institute for Strategic Studies. Retrieved from <https://niss.gov.ua/en/node/3492> [in Ukrainian]. [Паливода В. Підходи Словаччини до боротьби з гібридними загрозами: аналітика від експерта НІСД. *Національний інститут стратегічних досліджень*, 2020. URL: <https://niss.gov.ua/en/node/3492> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Radchenko, Yu. (2022). New Perspectives on the Study of the Holocaust in Ukraine from the Perspective of Multiculturalism. *Ideology and Politics Journal*, 2 (21), 85–104 [in Ukrainian]. [Радченко Ю. Нові перспективи дослідження історії Голокосту в Україні з позиції мультикультуралізму. *Журнал «Ідеологія і політика»*, 2020, 2 (21). С. 85–104].
- Robin, M. (2023). European anti-propaganda policies. *Robert Schumann Foundation, European Issues*, 665. Retrieved from <http://surl.li/pfbcr> [in English]. [Robin M. European anti-propaganda policies. *Robert Schumann Foundation, European Issues*, 665. 2023. URL: <http://surl.li/pfbcr> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Sherman, Sh. (2023, February 21). Israel refuses entry to member of EU parliament for terror ties. *Jewish News Syndicate*. Retrieved from <https://shorturl.at/uJS24> [in English]. [Sherman Sh. Israel refuses entry to member of EU parliament for terror ties. *Jewish News Syndicate*. 2023, February 21. URL: <https://shorturl.at/uJS24> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].
- Spanish minister wants the world to isolate Israel (2023, November 9) *MercoPress*. Retrieved from <http://surl.li/pfbdn> [in English]. [Spanish minister wants the world to isolate Israel. *MercoPress*. 2023, November 9. URL: <http://surl.li/pfbdn> (дата звернення: 13.11.2023)].
- Staff, T., & AFP (2023, October 24). Israel demands UN chief resign after he says Hamas attacks ‘did not occur in vacuum’ *The Times of Israel* Retrieved from <http://surl.li/pfbcd> [in English]. [Staff T., AFP. Israel demands UN chief resign after he says Hamas attacks ‘did not occur in vacuum’ *The Times of Israel* 2023, October 24. URL: <http://surl.li/pfbcd> (дата звернення: 30.10.2023)].
- Wagenheim, M. (2023, April 25). Protesting UN debate on Yom Hazikaron, Israeli ambassador reads names of fallen Israelis. *Jewish News Syndicate*. Retrieved from <http://surl.li/iowbw> [in English]. [Wagenheim M. Protesting UN debate on Yom Hazikaron, Israeli ambassador reads names of fallen Israelis. *Jewish News Syndicate*. 2023, April 25. URL: <http://surl.li/iowbw> (дата звернення: 29.06.2023)].

Стаття надійшла до редакції 12.01.2024

Хмель А. О.

кафедра міжнародних відносин та зовнішньої політики
Чорноморський національний університет імені Петра Могили
вул. 68 Десантників, 10, м. Миколаїв, 54003, Україна

ГІБРИДНІ ЗАГРОЗИ, ЩО ҐРУНТУЮТЬСЯ НА АНТИСЕМІТИЗМІ ТА АНТИ-ІЗРАЇЛЬСЬКІЙ ПРОПАГАНДІ В СУЧАСНИХ ІСПАНСЬКО-ІЗРАЇЛЬСЬКИХ ВІДНОСИНАХ

В останні роки Ізраїль та Іспанія зіткнулися з низкою безпекових викликів, включаючи тероризм, кібератаки та дезінформаційні кампанії. Хоча іспансько-ізраїльські відносини постійно розвиваються, дослідники вказують на існування суперечливих позицій відносно Ізраїлю в іспанському суспільстві та політиці. В іспанському

суспільстві існують організації та окремі особи, які поширюють антисемітизм та анти-ізраїльську пропаганду, часто засновану на викривленому та упередженому погляді на арабо-ізраїльський конфлікт, спотвореному хибними уявленнями, стереотипами та дезінформацією про Ізраїль та його політику. Більше того, вони не лише загрожують єврейському народу, але й підривають цінності толерантності, поваги та людської гідності нееврейського населення Іспанії, яке або протидіє таким злочинам, або підтримує їх прямо чи опосередковано. Тому боротьба з антисемітизмом та анти-ізраїльською пропагандою з боку Іспанії за підтримки Ізраїлю може покращити політику в галузі прав людини в цих країнах і сприяти розвитку більш толерантного міжнародного суспільства.

Методологія дослідження включає в собі методи порівняльного та описового аналізу, які використовуються для вивчення динаміки взаємовідносин між Ізраїлем та Іспанією у сфері протидії гібридним загрозам, з акцентом на антисемітизм та анти-ізраїльську пропаганду в контексті міжнародних відносин. Порівняльний метод використовувався для зіставлення різних подій в іспано-ізраїльських відносинах з метою виявлення закономірностей і тенденцій у взаєминах. Описовий метод використовувався для характеристики цих особливостей відносин.

Завдання цього дослідження – проаналізувати гібридні загрози, засновані на антисемітизмі та анти-ізраїльській пропаганді, в сучасних іспансько-ізраїльських відносинах і запропонувати шляхи протидії цим загрозам та сприяння більш конструктивним і взаємовигідним відносинам. Дослідження має на меті виявити взаємні помилки в сучасних іспансько-ізраїльських відносинах і запропонувати цілісне усвідомлення необхідності спільних зусиль.

Особливості дослідження: досліджено проблеми людської безпеки в міжнародних відносинах з акцентом на вивченні складностей антисемітських та анти-ізраїльських наративів, помилок і хибних уявлень Іспанії щодо Ізраїлю. Наукова новизна дослідження полягає в тому, що вперше в українській науці досліджено гібридні загрози, засновані на антисемітизмі та антиізраїльській пропаганді, в сучасних іспансько-ізраїльських відносинах.

Основні результати дослідження: очевидні факти посилення антисемітизму та анти-ізраїльської пропаганди в Іспанії, відсутність рішучих заяв та дій з боку іспанської влади щодо терористів та їх прихильників в ЄС, а також протидія іспанського уряду визнанню повного і законного права Ізраїлю захищати населення Святої Землі від арабських терористичних організацій, викликають серйозне занепокоєння та негативно впливає на взаємовідносини між державами.

Ключові слова: Іспанія, Ізраїль, гібридні загрози, антисемітизм, анти-ізраїльська пропаганда, міжнародні відносини, гуманітарна безпека.